

INVESTIGATION OF THE EXTERNAL EFFECTS OF ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES IN ISLAMIC ECONOMY

Mohammad Jan Rahmani

Al-Mustafa International University, Qom, I. R. Iran

Seyyed Abdulhamid Thabit

Al-Mustafa International University, Qom, I. R. Iran

Seyyed Hamid Joshghani Naini

Al-Mustafa International University, Qom, I. R. Iran

All economic activities have main and secondary effects. The main effects determine the economic position of the economic activity and constitute the purpose and motivation of the economic firms. But the secondary effects in the economic literature are known as external effects, and they are divided into two types of negative and positive effects. Capitalist and Islamic economic systems have reacted and faced external effects based on their own principles and foundations. In the capitalist economy receiving taxes and monetary penalty, from the firms that carry out such economic activities, is used as a mechanism. In Islamic economy, according to the principles of Islamic economics, only negative external effects should be compensated because it is the right of people. In contrast, the positive externalities that people receive without paying money to companies are a type of benevolence and charity. There is no need to compensate by beneficiaries. While, according to the principles of capitalist economy, even the positive external effects must be compensated because if they are not compensated, they will reduce the economic efficiency. The research method in this research is the library and descriptive-analytical method, which has been discussed using various Islamic and economic sources.

Keywords: *economic effects, externalities, economic activities, Islamic economy*

Corresponding author: rahmanimohammad256@gmail.com

Corresponding author: sah_sabet@yahoo.com

Corresponding author: mirsady@gmail.com

Introduction

Economic activities have several effects on economic units and society. One of the most important effects is the external effect, which includes positive and negative external effects which is called externality. In economics, positive externality is a benefit received or transferred to a party as an indirect effect of the transactions of another party. Negative externality, on the other hand, is the imposition of a cost on a party as an indirect effect of the economic activity of another party. External effects reduce economic efficiency (Stiglitz 2013: 278–280).

Each of the economic sectors such as agriculture, industry and services, as they create positive external effects on other sector and the society, also create negative external effects. The activities of the industry sector produce negative external effects such as water and air pollution that harm the health of sea creatures, plants, agricultural and people's health.

Also, agricultural activities such as livestock, harvesting and high consumption of water for irrigation, etc., cause changes in climatic conditions. The activities of the service sector also have negative external effects such as noise and air pollution, which cause problems for the society and other sectors. Now, considering having externality, this question is raised: Are companies and organizations allowed to carry out economic activities that have negative and positive external effects? In order to answer this question, the topics of this article are presented in the form of principles governing economic activities, examining the effects and consequences of economic activities and drawing conclusions.

1. Principles Governing Economic Activities

In Islamic economy, economic activities are carried out under the rule of specific principles that are derived from the value foundations of Islamic economics. Principles specify that economic activities must be carried out based on governing principles. Therefore, in this part, the essential principles related to this issue are discussed as follows:

A. The Principle of Responsibility

There are many verses in the Quran and traditions that emphasize human responsibility. Many verses of the Quran introduce cooperation as a moral, social responsibility and a source of inspiration (Tawba: 60; al-Ma'idah: 2). As God says in *surah* Mumtahanah, verse 8: "Treat with kindness and justice those who did not fight with you and did not drive you out of your country". Also there are many narrations that emphasize responsibility.

As the Prophet of Islam says: “People are responsible for each other” (Deilami 1991: I/184), and says: “A person who is not responsible for another person is not a Muslim” (Kulayni 1988: II/163).

Some *hadiths* show that the cooperation and benefit are examples of human responsibility. The Prophet of Islam says: “The best people are those who benefit the society and benevolence to people”. Or Imam Ali says: “The best people are those who have responsibility and care for people” (Reyshahri 2005: III/214). Both these *hadiths* emphasize the responsibility of humans to provide benefits and cooperation with people and society.

Therefore, according to Islamic orders, responsibility is a human and Islamic principle. Based on this principle, economic activities should be carried out. As it has been mentioned in numerous *hadiths* from Imam Sadiq and Imam Ali (*Nahj al-Balagha*, letter 53) – the people and the government have the responsibility to provide the real needs of the people with legitimate business.

B. The Principle of Non-Harm

The principle of non-harm is a jurisprudential rule, which is actually a continuation of the same principle of responsibility that should govern commercial relations and economic activities. Know that responsibility can have two meanings. One is that businessmen are responsible to provide benefits to each other and the society. In Islam, this type of work is one of the concepts of cooperation. But another concept of the principle of responsibility is the principle of no loss and damage to each other and the society. In other words, when a businessman cannot benefit the society, he should not harm the society. Because the not-harming and preventing harm is a moral and social responsibility. Such moral and social responsibilities affect the business and economic system and give it a human meaning.

This principle is derived from the Quranic verses and various narrations. Especially verses 3 and 2 of *surah* Mutaffifin: “Those who sell their goods with less weight in business and take the customer’s with more weight, they are in the hell”. Verse 8 of *surah* Hud: “Weigh and measure according to justice, and do not leave less than the rights of the people”. The famous prophetic narration goes “There is no harm in Islam”. As a result, this is a general legal rule, it includes material and moral losses, and no one should harm himself or others, whether Muslim or non-Muslim (Javadi Amoli 2018: 50–51).

C. The Principle of Social Justice

The establishment of social justice is expressed as the philosophy of the sending of prophets (Hadid: 25). Several definitions have been mentioned for

the concept of justice from the terminological point of view, and one meaning is “putting everything in its place” (*Nahj al-Balagha*, wisdom 431). Likewise, Imam Ali says: “Giving the right to its owner” (*ibid.*, letter 47). Tabatabai also means respecting the rights of individuals and giving the right to every owner (Tabatabai 1984: XII/276). Another meaning of justice is that justice and oppression are considered to be two contradictory concepts, that is, justice is the opposite of oppression.

According to sermon 176 in *Nahj al-Balagha*, there are two types of oppression: (1) oppression that is unforgivable; (2) oppression to be forgiven. The unforgivable oppression is polytheism. Almighty God says: “God does not forgive the sin of polytheism against Himself” (al-Nisa: 48). And oppression of some servants over others, that is, the loss of people’s rights is a type of oppression that is questioned as a human right. The oppression that is forgiven is the oppression of the slave against himself, when he commits some small sins.

Sadr considers the realization of social justice to be based on two principles, namely, the principle of the principle of mutual responsibility and the guarantee of the family (Sadr 2012: 288), and believes that establishing social justice based on these two principles is the duty of the government and the people.

a) The Principle of Mutual Responsibility

Mutual responsibility means that society members are responsible for each other based on Islamic brotherhood. After the establishment of the Islamic State, the Prophet of Islam started his first political work by creating brotherhood between *Muhajirin* and *Ansar* in Medina (*ibid.*: 289).

b) The Principle of Family Guarantee

In a letter to Malik Ashtar, Imam Ali said: “The people are the families of the government, bread-eaters and tax-givers of the government. It is the government’s duty to take care of their families and provide benefits to them and to remove and compensate them for their losses” (*Nahj al-Balagha*, letter 51).

D. The Principle of Negation of Problem and Difficulty

The principle of the negation of difficulty and hardship is one of the principles and rules of jurisprudence. It means that whenever an obligation is extremely difficult, that obligation is cancelled. This jurisprudential rule in-

cludes religious and financial obligations and can be cited in various cases. One of the cases that can be cited and its application is related to economic activities. In such a way that if economic activities are not carried out in the society due to the presence of negative external effects, the society's economy will be disturbed and difficulties and embarrassment will arise, because many economic activities have negative effects.

In many of the verses in Quran, God denied the obligation to do harm work and said that there is no harm in religion (Haji: 78). Similarly, in *surah al-Baqarah*, verses 280 and 185, God also orders you to do easy things (Najafi 1990: 354). In *surah al-Baqarah*, verse 195, God also says that by doing hard work, you will be destroyed, and do not let yourself be destroyed.

In the narrative sources, there are many *hadiths* that indicate this principle, and, in addition, all jurists have also used the rule of destruction to prove this rule (Masudinia & Alizade 2009: 22). In the end, this principle is the negation of difficulty and embarrassment from the rules of jurisprudence which are deduced from verses and narrations.

E. Principle of Expediency

The principle of expediency is one of the key bases for solving emerging issues and problems today. It is the most important tool to adapt the holy system of jurisprudence. Expediency in Ibn Manzur's definition: *al-Islah* is the opposite of corruption, in *Majma al-Bahrayn* there is a good expediency that is, doing this work is good and beneficial. The Shia and Sunni jurists, considering the development of this meaning, use it as a rule of jurisprudence. Moreover, the Sunnis use it as one of the bases for deriving rulings and consider it as one of the bases for deriving rulings. The narrations and viewpoints of jurists and the Quran state that all transactions and others are legalized based on the expediency and benefit of people in this world and the hereafter.

There are many examples of expediency. For instance, the Islamic ruler can force the hoarder to bring out his grain and sell it in the Muslim market and he can determine the price based on expediency (Mofid 1989: I/616). Wherever the expediency or interest of the lender requires, his debt must be paid (Hilli 1992: 157). Finally, one of the most important principles governing the economic activities of companies is the principle of expediency.

F. The Principle of Priority of People's Rights over God's Rights

The terms of the right of people and the right of God have been discussed among religious believers for a long time; especially the title of human rights, which is very important in their view to respect this right of the people. If

there is a conflict between the right of God and the right of people, the right of people is the first among the famous jurists (Hashemi Shahrudi 2001: I/118; Kashani 1983: 19). Imam Ali says that God has given rights to His servants and He has put their rights before his own rights, and whoever respects the rights of his servants respects the divine rights.

The rights that are established to protect the special worldly interests of individuals and to establish a right for them are the rights of the people (Zoheili 1996: IV/13–14). Finally, according to Islamic teachings and the viewpoint of jurists, the right of the people has the following characteristics:

a) Unrepentant

The right of people is a fixed and necessary right of Shariah for another, which is legislated for the benefit of people. It cannot be repented of by repentance, unlike the right of Allah, which can be repented of. For example, cutting off the hand of a thief does not cause the loss of the rights of people, in other words, whether the hand is cut off or not, he must give the property to the owner, but the extent of theft of God's right can be removed with repentance (Tusi 1987: 97).

b) Respect for People's Rights by Satisfaction and Acquittal

Respect for people's rights by acquittal and obtaining the consent of the owner of the right is another characteristic. For example, absenteeism is the right of a person, because the dignity and credit of a person is respected like his property and life, so this right can only be obtained by obtaining satisfaction and acquitting him (Najafi 1990: 188).

c) Preservation of Special Interests

The right of people has a special and individual aspect and is legislated to protect special interests, unlike the right of Allah, which may have a general and general aspect, such as *Hudud* (implementation of Islamic law) (ibid.: 295), where the establishment of *Hudud* is a result of social duties, which are legislated based on the interest of the general public.

d) Claim by the Right Holder

The right of the people is a right that can be revoked only by obtaining the satisfaction of the owner of the right or forgiveness. The Islamic ruler is not allowed to assert the right and demand it before the owner of the right demands

it, even if the ruler is aware of this issue (Hoseini Rouhani 2013: III/205). The implementation of the law by the Islamic ruler depends on the request of the owner of the right (Muhaqqiq Hilli 1988: II/863).

Finally, one of the principles governing economic activities can be the principle of the priority of the rights of people over the rights of God, which shows the importance of the rights of people to God. These rights include the rights arising from individual assignments and have been described for the protection of special interests. But the rights are derived from social duties whose legislation is based on protecting interests. The interests of the general public are considered examples of God's rights.

2. Effects and Consequences of Economic Activities

In this part, the effects of economic activities are examined. Economic activities of companies generally have two types of effects, one is the main effects and the other is the secondary effects. Based on Islamic sources, economic activities are measured and evaluated according to their effects and roles in people's lives, under the rule of the ruling principles.

A. The Main Effects of Economic Sectors

The main effects of economic sectors are the effects and consequences where the economic activities are carried out for the same purpose and the main goal is the producer. According to the roles and economic capacities of each part of the activities, the producer initiates production and activity in that part.

According to Islamic teachings, it provides economic activities of construction and development in the society and provides the needs and wants of the people. In Islamic sources, construction and development are considered to be the source of revitalization and ownership. Therefore, in Islamic jurisprudence, there is a jurisprudence rule called "Ihya al-Mawat" that says that whoever develops dead and barren land becomes the owner.

The Holy Prophet of Islam says that every nation and people is obliged to develop a piece of dead land in order to become its owner (Tirmidhi 1999: III/662; Hurr Amili 1993: XVII/327). God says in many verses: "I made the earth and the sky a source of income for you" (Ibrahim: 32; Ra'd: 3). Failure to use these resources causes blasphemy (*kufran*) of God's blessings, poverty and destruction of cities and destruction (Ibrahim: 28; Qalam: 49).

According to Islamic teachings, there are generally three types of major economic activities, each of which has the main effects and consequences of providing the well-being of life, construction, development, etc.

a) The Main Effects of Agricultural Sector Activities

- 1) Reduction of poverty and inequality in villages. Because the activities of the agricultural sector take place in villages, it will lead to the reduction of poverty and the increase of employment in villages. Therefore, one of the effects of the activities of the agricultural sector is to reduce poverty and inequality and create sustainable prosperity in villages (Pishbahar, Pakzad & Qahremanzadeh 2018: 25).
- 2) Food supply. The agricultural sector is responsible for providing the country's food. Based on Islamic teachings, providing food is one of the necessities of life, and the activities of the agricultural sector have been introduced as the treasures of providing sustenance for people.

b) The Main Effects of Activities in the Industry Sector

According to Islamic teachings, the economic activity related to the industrial sector is emphasized because it provides the field for the extraction of mines and natural resources such as seas, winds, and iron (Nahl: 14). Also, in the narration of the activities of the industry sector, it is introduced as a useful and thought-provoking science. Also, in the narration of the activities of the industry sector, it is introduced as a useful science and application of knowledge. The industry sector provides the possibility of saving economic resources of a country and saves economic resources from being wasted (Albani 1987: 997).

According to the 2014 report of the World Bank, countries in the industrial sector have developed and other sectors have also improved. Also, the capital productivity in these countries has improved in all sectors.

c) Main Effects of Service Sector Activities

According to Islamic teachings, service activities such as transportation and trade have an important role in the economy of a country. Many verses of Quran and Islamic narrations order trade and the construction of transportation equipment (Mu'minun: 27), and ninety percent of people's wealth is provided through trade (Ibn Abi Jumhur 1982: II/242). Imam Ali also encouraged Muslims to do it and introduced trade as a source of wealth for the people (Kulayni 1988: V/149).

There is also historical evidence, that when the Prophet of Islam migrated to Madina with a number of Meccan people who had tried trade and crafts, most of the people of Medina were engaged in agriculture and did not have a good economic situation. Therefore, in order to improve the economic condi-

tions of the people of Medina, the Prophet of Islam established a commercial agreement between a number of immigrants and the people of Medina.

B. External Effects of Economic Activities

Each of the economic sectors such as agriculture, industry, and services, as they create positive external effects on each other and the society, also create negative external effects. The activities of the industry sector create negative external effects such as water and air pollution, which harms the health of marine products, plants and agricultural products and people's health. Also, agricultural activities such as livestock, extracting water, using a lot of water for irrigation, etc., cause changes in climatic conditions. The activities of the service sector also have negative external effects, such as creating noise and air pollution, which causes damage to the society and other sectors.

As a result, each of the economic sectors can have external effects, and these external effects have been the focus of capitalist and Islamic economics, in other words, how to deal with the external effects of the economy. Due to the fact that economic activities such as agriculture, industry and services have positive and negative external effects on each other, the society and the environment, it has been taken into account in capitalist and Islamic economy as follows.

a) Facing the Capitalist Economy with the External Effects of the Economy

Considering the external effects that exist in economic activities, in the capitalist economy, the discussion of green economy was raised by economists. Green economy emphasizes better use of natural resources with the least damage to the environment and people. Also, in the capitalist economy, they emphasize sustainable development in order to protect the interests of the current and future generations from the environment (Mesbahi Moghadam, Rezai & Movahedi Yeknazar 2019: 85). In order to reduce costs and compensate for the losses caused by economic activities, they propose solutions such as the introduction of a penal law for environmental destruction, setting penalty and collecting taxes from loss-making units. Pigou believes that the loss-making company should be taxed as much as the losses incurred. Joseph Stiglitz, the winner of the economic Nobel in 2001, believes that taxes and fines should be taken when external effects have reduced efficiency (production below capacity) in economic activities, otherwise they should not be taken because external effects have not harmed efficiency (Stiglitz 2013: 83). As a result, in the capitalist economy, economists propose and suggest collecting taxes and fines from loss-making companies as a mechanism and solution.

b) Facing Islamic Economy with External Effects

Islamic economy is based on the assumption that economic activities are carried out under the rule of the ruling principles and provide the best and most economic and social benefits with the least cost and economic loss (Karami & Gudarzi 2016: 106). As a result, Islamic economics deals with the external effects in economic activities, with this assumption and under the rule of the ruling principles, and offers many solutions.

1) Government Solution

Some Muslim economists propose the solutions that have been proposed in the capitalist economy based on the rule of harmlessness and narratives. In order to deal with the external effects of the economy, they believe that the methods of provincial taxation and the establishment of laws should be used by the Islamic government, and the Islamic government is obliged to use these tools to deal with the external effects (Mesbahi Moghadam, Rezai & Movahedi Yeknazar 2019: 83).

2) Targeting Solution

Another way that Muslim economists have proposed in the face of external effects is that in order to achieve goals such as reducing poverty and inequality, accepting external losses and effects is a desirable and good thing in this case. Moreover, if it does not reduce poverty and inequality, it is not desirable to tolerate, and the external effects will be undesirable and must be prevented (Karami & Gudarzi 2016: 119).

3) Detailed Solution

3a) Solution Facing Negative Effects

In terms of Islamic economy, there are two types of economic activities. One type is that some economic activities are dominated by their practicality. According to the ruling principles, especially the rule of harmlessness, these types of activities are forbidden and you should not engage in these types of activities. The second type is that some economic activities, in which their practical predominance is a benefit and not loss, according to the ruling principles, especially the rule of expediency, are a desirable thing, and the presence of their negative external effects is acceptable and tolerable (Mesbahi Moghadam, Rezai & Movahedi Yeknazar 2019: 76).

According to the rule of expediency, the economic activity whose benefit is greater than its loss and which is necessary for the people and society must be done and doing it is good and beneficial. However, the losses incurred must also be compensated, and the rule of expediency cannot be the permission to impose unprepared losses on the people. The rule of expediency does not eliminate the rights of people, because the damages caused to the people are considered the right of the people. Therefore, according to the opinion of jurists, the rights of people should be given to the heirs even if the owner of the property has died. Or, if the owner of the property does not know the name, he should reject the atrocities on behalf of the owner of the property (Behjat 2007: IV/317). The method of compensating these types of losses is the responsibility of the government and the people according to the principle of public guarantee (principle of social justice).

3b) Solution Faced with Positive Effects

If economic activities have positive and beneficial external effects, according to Islamic economics, it is a kind of charity and there is no need to compensate. According to the principle of responsibility, kindness to each other is part of the duties of a Muslim and an example of investing for the motive of reward and does not reduce efficiency. In the capitalist economy, though, this is considered a free ride and causes a decrease in the efficiency of economic activities, so it must be compensated for this.

Conclusion

It should be taken into consideration that each of the economic activities has main and secondary effects and consequences. The main effects and consequences are the first goal of economic activities. Based on the principle of responsibility and interest, etc., such activities are carried out with the motive of benefiting the society and meeting the needs and wishes of the people. Nevertheless, the secondary effects and consequences of economic activities are known as the external effects of economic activities, which do not constitute the main and primary goal of economic units, but are considered a necessity of an economic activity. These external effects can be negative or positive. Therefore, capitalist and Islamic economies have faced this problem according to their own principles and foundations.

In the capitalist economy, the existence of external effects of economic activities causes the reduction of economic efficiency, therefore, for this purpose, it proposes a solution to compensate the efficiency by collecting taxes and fines from the companies that perform economic activities. In the Islamic

economic system, faced with external, negative and positive effects, it is based on the ruling principles that are provided. According to the ruling principles, it offers two different types of solution with negative and positive effects.

In terms of Islamic economy, there are two types of economic activities. One type is that some economic activities are more harmful. According to the ruling principles, especially the rule of harmlessness, these types of activities are forbidden and you should not engage in these types of activities. Other types of economic activities are more useful and their main goal is to benefit. According to the ruling principles, especially the rule of expediency, such activities are desirable and deserve to be done, and the existence of their negative external effects is acceptable and bearable, but their losses are according to the ruling principles, such as the rule of non-harm, the principle of social justice (guarantee of promotion and public guarantee), the principle of responsibility and preceding the rights of people, so, they should be prepared and compensated because it is considered the right of people.

The rule of expediency does not eliminate the rights of the people, and the damages caused to the people are considered the rights of the people, so it should be compensated. The way to compensate for these types of losses is the responsibility of the government and the people. However, if economic activities have positive and beneficial external effects for others, it is a kind of charity from the point of view of Islamic economics as it does not reduce economic efficiency. So, these types of effects are not necessary for compensation. According to the principle of responsibility, giving beneficence is one of the duties of a Muslim and is a valid investment for the motivation of reward and does not reduce efficiency, whereas, in the capitalist economy, this is considered a free ride and causes a decrease in the efficiency of economic activities, so it must be compensated for.

Received: November 28th, 2023

Accepted: December 21st, 2023

References

The holy Quran.

Nahj al-Balagha.

Albani, Muhammad Naser al-Din (1987), *Za'if al-Jami' al-Saghir wa Ziyadatuh*, 2nd edition, Beirut, Al-Maktab al-Islami.

Behjat, Muhammad Taqi (2007), *Estefta*, vol. IV, Qom, Daftar Ayatollah Behjat.

Deilami, Abu al-Hasan (1991), *Irshad al-Qulub*, vol. I, Qom, Sharif Razi Publications.

- Hashemi Shahrudi, Mahmud (2001), *Al-Hajj*, vol. I, Qom, Ansarian Institute.
- Hilli, Allameh (1992), *Qava'id al-Ahkam*, vol. I, Qom, Al-Nashr al-Islami Institute.
- Hoseini Rouhani, Sadiq (2013), *Minhaj al-Salihin*, vol. III, Beirut, Dar li al-Tiba'ah.
- Hurr Amili (1993), *Vasa'il al-Shi'a*, vol. XVII, Qom, Alu Al-Bayt.
- Ibn Abi Jumhur, Muhammad (1982), *Awali Al-La'ali*, vol. IV, Qom, Seyyed al-Shohada.
- Javadi Amoli, Abdollah (2018), *International Relations in Islam*, Qom, Esra.
- Karami M. H. & Gudarzi S. (2016), "The Place of Foreign Works in Conventional and Islamic Economics", *Knowledge of Islamic Economics* 17 (1).
- Kashani, Mulla Habibullah Sharif (1983), *Tashil al-Masalik ila al-Madarik fi Ru'us al-Qava'id al-Fiqhiyyah*, Qom, al-Matba'at al-Alamiya.
- Kulayni, Siqah al-Islam (1988), *Al-Kafi*, vol. II, Tehran, Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiya.
- Masudinia, M. & Alizade Y. (2009), "Economic Aspects of the Rule of Negation of Difficulty and Embarrassment in Islamic Jurisprudence", *Economic Jurisprudence Studies Quarterly* 3 (3).
- Mesbahi Moghadam G., Rezai M. J. & Movahedi Yeknazar M. (2019), "Analysis of How to Deal with Negative External Effects from the Point of View of Islamic Economy", *Quarterly Practical-Specialized Islamic Economics* 2 (1).
- Mofid, Muhammad (1989), *Al-Muqna'a*, vol. I, Qom, Al-Nashr al-Islami Institute.
- Muhaqqiq Hilli, Abu al-Qasim Ja'far (1988), *Shara'i' al-Islam*, vol. I, Qom, Esteghlal.
- Najafi, Mohammad Hassan (1990), *Jawahir al-Kalam*, vol. XXII, Tehran, Dar al-Kutub al-Islamiya.
- Pishbahar, I., Pakzad, B. & Qahremanzadeh, M. (2018), "Investigating the Mutual Relationship between Rural Income Inequality and the Development of the Agricultural Sector in Iran", *Journal of Agricultural Economics* 13 (4).
- Reyshahri, Muhammad (2005), *Mizan al-Hikmah*, vol. III, Qom, Dar al-Hadith Publisher.
- Sadr, Mohammad Baqir (2012), *Iqtisaduna*, Qom, Bustan Ketab.
- Stiglitz, Joseph (2013), *Eqtesad, Bakhsh-e Omumi*, translated by Askari Mohammad Mahdi, Qom, Houze wa Daneshgah Research Institute.
- Tabatabai, Mohammad Hossein (1984), *Al-Mizan*, translated by Seyyed Mohammad Bagher Musavi Hamedani, Tehran, Allameh Tabatabai Scientific and Cultural Foundation.
- Tirmidhi, Abu Isa (1999), *Al-Jami' al-Sahih*, vol. III, Cairo, Dar al-Hadith.
- Tusi, Muhammad Ali bin Hamzah (1987), *al-Vasilah ila Nayl al-Fadilah*, Qom, Ayatollah Mar'ashi Najafi Library.
- Zoheili, Vahaba (1996), *Al-Fiqh al-Islami wa Adillatuh*, Damascus, Dar al-Fikr.